ETHICS CHALLENGE:
HELP THE BULLY

LESSON OVERVIEW

Grade Levels: 3-5

In this lesson, students will participate in a writing activity and in-depth discussion about whether it is possible during a disaster to help another person who had previously been a bully.

STANDARDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CCSS ELA.CCRA.W.1</th>
<th>Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CCSS ELA.CCRA.W.3</td>
<td>Write narratives to develop real or imagined experiences or events using effective technique, well-chosen details and well-structured event sequences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCSS.ELA.LITERACY.SL.3-5.1</td>
<td>Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grade 3-5 topics and texts, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OBJECTIVES

- Students will discuss different scenarios from the I Survived books by Lauren Tarshis.
- Students will write an argument supporting their decision in an ethical dilemma.
- Students will discuss and explore the possible consequences of that decision.

MATERIALS

- Image depicting individual in a post-disaster situation

PROCEDURE

STEP 1: In many of the I Survived books, the main character experiences being bullied by another character before the disaster occurs. Then during the disaster, he encounters that bully again and the main character has to decide if he should offer help now that the bully needs it. Discuss these scenes with the students.

STEP 2: As a class, decide on a disaster event (earthquake, tornado, volcanic eruption, etc.) that the students have just survived. Using a projector or the whiteboard, show students the picture of a teen boy with backpack. Explain that this is a photo of the school bully. He’s been stealing lunches and hassling students all year. Your group has just come in contact with him after the disaster. He’s alone and possibly injured.

smartspaceniu.com
STEP 3: Introduce this writing prompt to the students. What would you do when coming into contact with this person?

1. Offer him help—he’s hurt you before but maybe he can change now that he needs you.
2. Ignore him and go on your own way—he’s hurt you before and he might do again.
3. Gang up on him and try to steal his supplies—he’s a bully and does not deserve your help.

Students should decide what they would do by simply looking at the picture. They will know nothing else about the person. They must explain the reasoning behind their decision and why they think it is the best option. Encourage students to create a background story for the person pictured and use that to defend their responses.

STEP 4: Once students have been given ample time to make their decision and form their argument, engage students in a discussion about the possible repercussions of each of the available options. They should explore the possible benefits and dangers of each response. During this time, have students share their essays and explain their reasoning. Students will likely offer a variety of reasons why they made their decision.

STEP 5: Pose these follow-up questions:

- After hearing your peers’ responses and discussing the possible outcomes of this scenario, do you think there is one correct way to react?
- How would your response to this question change if you were in charge of protecting little kids or younger siblings?
- How would your response to this question change if you knew the aftereffects of the disaster were permanent and that the world you lived in before the event would never exist again?
- How would your response change if the picture was of a very elderly woman? If you would respond differently, please explain.

STEP 6: OPTIONAL: Have students research how people reacted, both positively and negatively, during the real disasters depicted in the I Survived books. For example: after Hurricanes Katrina, there were acts of looting but also ordinary people performed great acts of heroism to help strangers. Students could use this research to reflect on how they would have behaved in these real-life situations.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RUBRIC</th>
<th>Target (3)</th>
<th>Meets (2)</th>
<th>Partially Meets (1)</th>
<th>Does Not Meet (0)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ARGUMENT SUPPORT</td>
<td>Argument addresses all prompt questions and provides ample reasons and examples.</td>
<td>Argument addresses all prompt questions and provides some reasons or examples.</td>
<td>Argument either does not address all prompt questions or does not provide enough reasons.</td>
<td>Argument does not address all prompt questions and does not provide reasons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRAMMAR AND SPELLING</td>
<td>There are no spelling, punctuation, or grammar errors.</td>
<td>There are a couple of spelling, punctuation, or grammar errors.</td>
<td>There are several spelling, punctuation and grammar errors</td>
<td>There are many spelling, punctuation and grammar errors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRITING STRUCTURE</td>
<td>The writing is very well organized. One idea or scene follows into another in a logical sequence with clear transitions</td>
<td>The writing is well organized. One idea or scene may seem out of place. Transitions are used.</td>
<td>The structure of the writing is somewhat confusing. The transitions are sometimes unclear.</td>
<td>The writing lacks coherent organization.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REQUIREMENTS</td>
<td>Meets all of the requirements for the project.</td>
<td>Meets most of the requirements for the project.</td>
<td>Meets some of the requirements for the project.</td>
<td>Does not meet the requirements for the project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEMONSTRATION OF KNOWLEDGE OF CONTENT IN DISCUSSIONS AND ACTIVITIES</td>
<td>Does a great job showing an understanding of the content covered in class.</td>
<td>Does an okay job with showing an understanding of the content covered in class.</td>
<td>Tries but has a difficult time showing an understanding of the content covered in class.</td>
<td>Does not show an understanding of the content covered in class.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Total                                |                                                                             |                                                                           |                                                                          | /

smartspaceniu.com